UNIVERSITY OF CALIFORNIA | Systemwide Human Resources

Search Advisory and Hiring Committee Best Practices

Quick Reference Guide

Committee Chair Responsibilities

- Form, train and prepare hiring committee
- Foster supportive committee environment
- Ensure committee acts in compliance with law
- Enact bias management strategies
- Stress the importance of and ensure candidate and committee confidentiality
- Respond to deviations from accepted practice as necessary
- Lead committee in forming and executing a standardized candidate evaluation plan
- Partner with stakeholders
- Ensure candidate pool is diverse and not influenced by bias
- Monitor and manage the influence of bias throughout process
- Represent committee's recommendations to the hiring manager
- Lead committee through equitable and effective hiring process

Committee Member Responsibilities

- Help draft job description and evaluation criteria
- Treat all candidates fairly, equally and with respect
- Uphold dignity and reputation of the University
- Ensure compliance with all laws and UC policies
- Protect candidate and committee confidentiality
- Make concerted effort to detect and manage the influence of bias
    - This may include completion of UC bias management trainings
        - UC Managing Implicit Bias Series
        - UCLA Implicit Bias Videos and Resources
- Actively participate in committee discussion, evaluation and bias management
- Call the potential influence of bias to the attention of the committee chair
- Recommend final candidates to be considered by the hiring manager

Requirements and Best Practices

- Form a diverse hiring committee

- Consider including a representative of the offices of the Chief Diversity Officer, Equal Employment Opportunity and Affirmative Action, Title IX, or Equity and Inclusion

- Ensure familiarity with the UC Principles of Community

- Protect candidate and committee confidentiality
    - Do not disclose candidate names
    - Do not share committee materials or discussions outside the committee

- Do not evaluate candidates relative to or ask questions related to protected categories

- Implement a plan to manage the influence of individual and group biases
    - Raise awareness through bias trainings/resources and IATs
    - Promote mindfulness and other active de-biasing techniques
    - Foster a supportive environment in which biases can be discussed

- When developing the job description and requirements:
    - Prioritize the competencies, experience and duties most essential to the job functions and workplace realities
    - Avoid approaching the process with a specific or ideal candidate in mind
    - Ensure the number of required and preferred qualifications is reasonable
    - Include a statement that UC is an EEO/AA employer
        - The Human Resources Office can provide approved verbiage for this

- Identify and utilize a wide array of professional networks, including those representing traditionally underrepresented groups, to help foster a diverse candidate pool

- Do not source, research the background of or recruit candidates
    - Avoid social media platforms like Facebook, LinkedIn, Twitter, etc.

- Develop standardized evaluation measures to ensure all candidates are evaluated equitably according to the same objective measures
    - Quantify as much as possible
        - Develop and utilize an evaluation rubric or rating guide
    - Ensure each candidate's experience is as similar as possible

- Use the standardized evaluation measures as the basis for developing interview questions

- Avoid ambiguous criteria and loaded language
    - If they occur, investigate if they indicate the potential influence of bias

Legal Considerations

AVOIDING DISCRIMINATION

Employers cannot discriminate on the basis of any of these legally protected categories; do not evaluate candidates relative to or ask questions related to these categories:

- Race
- Color
- Religion
- Sex
- Age
- Citizenship
- Ethnicity
- National origin

- Ancestry
- Sexual orientation
- Marital status
- Gender
- Gender identity
- Gender transition status
- Gender expression

- Mental disability
- Physical disability
- Medical condition
- Pregnancy
- Genetic information
- Military/veteran status or service

Similarly, avoid evaluations and questions related to these categories:

- Current place of residence
- Family planning and needs

- Number of children
- Childcare arrangements

For more information, please refer to UC's Anti-Discrimination policy (pdf) (https://policy.ucop.edu/doc/4000376/DiscHarassAffirmAction).

ALTERNATE EVALUATION METHODS

The Equal Employment Opportunity Commission's (EEOC) Uniform Guidelines on Employee Selection Procedures (UGESP) establish employment test regulations.

UC committees must seek guidance and approval through their local office of human resources to incorporate validated employment testing.

AB 1008

Assembly Bill 1008 prohibits employers from seeking to learn a candidate's conviction history prior to a conditional offer being made, as detailed in PPSM-21.

Do not ask questions related to conviction history.

AB 168

Assembly Bill 168 prohibits employers from seeking an applicant's salary history or relying on it when determining a salary or employment offer.

Do not ask questions related to salary history.

Bias Management

INDIVIDUAL BIAS MANAGEMENT

- Be humble
  - Acknowledging your own potential to be influenced by bias helps you avoid and manage that influence
- Be aware
  - Take an implicit association test (IAT) to explore unconscious associations
  - Reflect on common cultural and cognitive biases
  - Be vigilant in situations wherein biases are more likely to occur: personnel evaluations, interpersonal communication, team participation
- Be mindful
  - Stop and ask yourself if you may be experiencing or acting upon the influence of an unconscious bias
  - Practice active de-biasing techniques
    - Counter example exposure: think of individuals who defy a certain stereotype
    - Stereotype replacement: if you recognize that your processes or conclusions are conforming to a stereotype, actively substitute a non-stereotypical thought, question or example, then re-assess the situation

GROUP BIAS MANAGEMENT

- Create or provide opportunities for group members to learn more about each other's backgrounds and build trust
- Recognize and discuss ambiguous phrases and loaded language that may indicate the influence of bias

SEARCH ADVISORY AND HIRING COMMITTEE BIAS MANAGEMENT

- Form diverse committees with equal representation in terms of: gender, race and ethnicity, age, background, status within the organization, experience and viewpoints
  - This will also signal to candidates that diversity, equity and inclusion matter beyond just words
- Establish standardized evaluation criteria and methodology, such as:
  - A candidate evaluation rubric
  - A pool of interview questions that are asked of all candidates
- Quantify and clearly define as much as possible to avoid subjectivity

Search Chair or Search Committee Lead Checklist

Use this checklist to track the actions taken by your committee.

* Indicates actions that could benefit the search/hiring process but may not be allowable at all UC locations; check with your local office of human resources before implementing.

COMMITTEE FORMATION

- ☐ Form a diverse committee
- ☐ Review committee chair and committee member responsibilities
- ☐ Review UC Principles of Community
- ☐ Review confidentiality rules and procedures
- ☐ Reviews laws impacting hiring
    - ○ Legal protections against discrimination
    - ○ Reasonable accommodations for candidates
    - ○ AB 1008 & AB 168
- ☐ Discuss and develop a plan for managing the influence of bias, especially implicit bias
    - ○ *Assign bias awareness and management trainings

THE JOB DESCRIPTION AND POSTING

- ☐ Prioritize abilities and experience most essential to the job functions
- ☐ Avoid excessive number of requirements
- ☐ Review committee member restrictions regarding sourcing, researching or recruiting candidates, and use of social media platforms
- ☐ If applicable, work with recruiter to develop a recruitment strategy
- ☐ Advertise position with and solicit candidates from a diverse array of professional networks, including those focused on traditionally underrepresented groups

CANDIDATE EVALUATION

- ☐ Develop and utilize standardized evaluation methods, including rubric or rating guide if applicable
- ☐ Develop and utilize standardized pool of interview questions and potential follow-ups that relate to job description and speak to standardized evaluation methods
- ☐ Review ambiguous and loaded language as possible indicators of bias
- ☐ Review common biases, including cognitive biases
- ☐ Ensure committee members feel empowered to share ideas and discuss potential biases
- ☐ *If applicable, work with local office of human resources to develop alternative evaluation methods
- ☐ *Remove demographic identifiers (name, gender, ethnicity, home/email address, etc.) from resumes to minimize the potential influence of implicit bias
- ☐ Ensure diverse representation within interview and selection panel

Resources

Training Transcript (pdf)
https://www.ucop.edu/human-resources/_files/training-materials/search-advisory-hiring-committee-best-practices-training-transcript.pdf

UC Principles of Community
https://ucnet.universityofcalifornia.edu/working-at-uc/our-values/principles-of-community.html

Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964
https://www.eeoc.gov/laws/statutes/titlevii.cfm

Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA)
https://www.ada.gov/

California Fair Employment and Housing Act (FEHA)
https://www.dfeh.ca.gov/employment/

UC Proposition 209 Guidelines (pdf)
https://diversity.universityofcalifornia.edu/files/documents/prop-209-summary.pdf

UC Managing Implicit Bias Series
https://ucnet.universityofcalifornia.edu/working-at-uc/your-career/talent-management/professional-development/managing-implicit-bias.html

UCLA Implicit Bias Videos and Resources
https://equity.ucla.edu/know/implicit-bias/

Project Implicit: Take an Implicit Association Test (IAT)
https://implicit.harvard.edu/implicit/takeatest.html

Are Emily and Greg More Employable than Lakisha and Jamal? A Field Experiment on Labor Market Discrimination
https://www.nber.org/papers/w9873.pdf

Science faculty's subtle gender biases favor male students
https://www.pnas.org/content/109/41/16474

Example candidate evaluation rubric (docx)
https://ucnet.universityofcalifornia.edu/working-at-uc/your-career/talent-management/talent-acquisition-employment/sahcbp-resources/example_rubric.docx

Equal Employment Opportunity Commission (EEOC) Regulations
https://www.eeoc.gov/laws/regulations/index.cfm

EEOC Fact Sheet on Employment Tests and Selection Procedures
https://www.eeoc.gov/policy/docs/factemployment_procedures.html

PPSM-21: Selection and Appointment (pdf)
https://policy.ucop.edu/doc/4010394/PPSM-21

UC Salary Inquiry Restrictions
https://ucnet.universityofcalifornia.edu/working-at-uc/your-career/talent-management/talent-acquisition-employment/ab-168-and-sb-1162.html

Quick Reference Guide (pdf)
https://ucnet.universityofcalifornia.edu/working-at-uc/your-career/talent-management/talent-acquisition-employment/sahcbp-resources/sahcbp_quick_reference_guide.pdf

Human Resources Offices by Location
https://ucnet.universityofcalifornia.edu/contacts/campus-contacts.html

UCnet Talent Acquisition & Employment
https://ucnet.universityofcalifornia.edu/working-at-uc/your-career/talent-management/talent-acquisition-employment/index.html

External Resources Library
(contains same resources listed here)
https://ucnet.universityofcalifornia.edu/working-at-uc/your-career/talent-management/talent-acquisition-employment/sahcbp-resources/index.html